

## **Economy Scrutiny Committee**

### **Minutes of the meeting held on 1 March 2017**

#### **Present:**

Councillor Richards– in the Chair  
Councillors Davies, Farrell, Hitchen, S Judge, Moore, H Priest, Raikes, Razaq, Shilton Godwin, A Simcock and Smitherman

Councillor B Priest, Deputy Leader  
Councillor Cooley, Lead Member for Age Friendly Manchester  
Councillor Loughman, Ward Councillor for Ancoats and Clayton Ward  
Councillor Ludford, Ward Councillor for Ancoats and Clayton Ward  
Councillor Manco, Ward Councillor for Ancoats and Clayton Ward  
Councillor Taylor, Ward Councillor for Bradfrord Ward

Jo MacKinnon - Head of Levenshulme High School for Girls  
Angela Foulkes - The Manchester College  
Lou Cordwell - CEO, Magnetic North  
Emma Stewart - Joint CEO, Timewise  
Jill Rubery - Professor of Comparative Employment Systems, Manchester Business School  
Dr Sheena Johnson - Occupational Psychologist. Senior Lecturer. Manchester Business School  
Beth Powell - Future Skills Project Manager Oxfam  
Atiha Chaudry - GM BME Network  
Victoria Bettany - Senior Researcher CLES

#### **ESC/17/16 Minutes**

#### **Decision**

To approve as a correct record the minutes of the meeting held on 1 February 2017.

#### **ESC/17/17 District Centres Subgroup Update**

Councillor Shilton Godwin provided the committee with an update of the work of the District Centres Subgroup. She informed the Committee that the Subgroup had been paused, and that officers were to return in September with further policy developments. She thanked all those who participated in the Subgroup.

#### **ESC/17/18 Eastlands**

The Strategic Director for Strategic Development outlined the report and its major themes. The purpose of the report was to seek the Executive's support for a new Regeneration framework for the Eastlands area and to seek an endorsement from the Executive to consult with residents, businesses, landowners and other stakeholders who were affected by the proposals set out in the draft planning framework with the view of reporting back the outcomes of that consultation to a

future meeting of the Executive. If approved by the Executive the final version of the Eastlands Regeneration Framework would provide a valuable tool to guide development and investment activity, and to provide a robust framework for determining planning applications.

A member commented that whilst they were positive about the framework specifically the higher education offer proposed in east Manchester they would like a commitment that any University would be a “good neighbour” and that local residents would benefit from any jobs created. In response the Strategic Director for Strategic Development said that Manchester City Council wanted to replicate the approach employed with Manchester Metropolitan University in Hulme and the approach adopted by the University of Manchester which had provided a clear and effective approach to getting local residents into new employment opportunities.

A member raised concerns that whilst the Framework addressed supporting businesses involved in sport it didn't address supporting small business, as well as other smaller measures to make the area a more desirable place to live. Following this a member commented that it was essential the Council work closely with its partners to ensure jobs created benefited local people.

A member commented on the lack of a focus on sense of place in the Framework, and asked this theme be scoped out in further detail. In response the Strategic Director for Strategic Development said this would be emphasised more clearly a future version of the Framework.

A member asked if the lack of reference to the voluntary and community sector in the report was intentional or an oversight. In response The Strategic Director for Strategic Development said this was an oversight, and that this will be addressed in the final version of the framework.

A member asked what was being done to address car parking space, transport linkages and infrastructure, having raised concerns with potential increased numbers of residents adding pressures to these services. In response the Strategic Director for Strategic Development acknowledged that transport links locally were an issue that needed to be explored further. Following this he outlined that the area had good Metrolink and cycle connections, reasonable pedestrian connections as well as 3,500 car parking spaces immediately to the north of the Stadium. Finally he again stated that the topic of transport and connectivity will be explored further in the final version of the framework.

A member asked what range of housing was going to be offered, and what segment of the housing market this was going to be aimed at. In response the Strategic Director for Strategic Development said that officers were seeking to develop a more diverse housing offer in the area. Following this he informed the committee that specific student accommodations would be required as part of the higher education offer.

A member asked members from Bradford ward and Ancoats and Clayton ward if in their view local people were receiving benefits from the sports facilities situated at

the Etihad campus. In response a member for Ancoats and Clayton said that the City Council, the Eastlands Trust and Manchester City Football Club needed to publicise their facilities more to the community, as at present they felt residents were not using them as much as they could be.

A member asked if plans to re-route the High Speed 2 train line would impact this framework and if this had been considered. In response the Strategic Director for Strategic Development said it was being taken account for in the framework. A member for Ancoats and Clayton ward raised concerns regarding potential student accommodations in the area, citing low demand terraced properties close to the Etihad Campus that had the potential to be converted into shared student properties. Following this he stated that focusing on sports facilities and student accommodations was not the right approach for local people in the area.

The Chair thanked officers for the report and members from Bradford ward and Ancoats and Clayton ward for their attendance for the item.

### **Decisions**

1. The Committee recommend that scrutiny be informed of when this item will come back in the next municipal year as soon as possible.
2. The Committee recommend that the issues of housing mix and student accommodation be explored in more detail.
3. The Committee recommend that the issues of community engagement be explored in more detail.
4. The Committee recommend that transportation links and interconnectivity in the area are explored in more detail.
5. The Committee recommend that Communities and Equalities Scrutiny Committee explore in more detail the involvement of the voluntary sector in the framework.
6. The Committee recommend that more detail be provided regarding how local residents will benefit from new job opportunities.
7. The Committee endorsed the recommendations to the Executive that;

The Executive is recommended to endorse the 2017 Eastlands Regeneration Framework, so that it can be used as a basis for further consultation with local stakeholders and landowners.

### **ESC/17/19 Women and the Economy**

The Committee received a report which sought to provide a summary of the key issues facing women in Manchester in relation to their participation and progression in the local labour market. There was much national & international data and to keep the report focused, it was themed on a number of key life stages for women from the

age 14 through to retirement, which could shape women's economic prospects. The report sought to provide a broad and balanced view of the key topics as a backdrop to the panel's discussion. The Committee welcomed a number of guests with expertise in education, skills, and barriers to the labour market, business and leadership who were invited to join the discussion and shared their knowledge and experience.

Jo MacKinnon, the Head of Levenshulme High School for Girls, spoke to the Committee. She outlined her role as a head teacher in engaging women in the economy, including through careers and guidance services, personal development and education. She informed the Committee that many services such as Connexions services and work experience had been hit by government cuts, and that this as well as poor connectivity with partners left room for improvement. Following this she outlined the provision of adult mentoring to girls to discuss their life journeys, and commented that this was positively received by students. However, she outlined that providing this service had challenges, such as finding time either in the school day or after school, especially for children with specific travel arrangements.

Angela Foulkes - The Manchester College presented to the Committee. She informed the committee that females were slightly outperforming males at The Manchester College. She went on to raise the theme of aspiration as key, and suggested more work needed to be done to promote higher skills, as well as the flexible development of skills. She also highlighted poor promotion of flexible opportunities across the sector as an issue, and that men should be involved in driving this agenda also. Finally she said that it was important to inform employers of the benefits of a flexible and diverse workforce.

Lou Cordwell - CEO, Magnetic North & GM LEP member presented to the Committee. She informed the Committee that in her experience most successful companies had diversity at the board level, and that having a spectrum of individuals was of great importance. She followed this by stating that the entrepreneurial culture needed to change, as only a tiny proportion of funding for start-ups went into female opened businesses. Following this she said that confidence, networking and having inspirational figures for young women were also key issues. She said that this work needs to start early in a child's development and that the prospect of women opening businesses needs to be normalised in society.

Emma Stewart, Joint CEO, Timewise presented to the Committee, outlining the work of the Timewise Foundation. She informed the Committee that the foundation worked with businesses to help them unlock more quality jobs on a part time and flexible basis, and that there were about 100,000 candidates in their network using their job searching website. As an organisation their approach was to make jobs people ready, working with organisations to implement flexible job design. She informed the Committee that market analysis suggested that only 8.7% of jobs on the market cater to those who don't want to work between the hours of 9am and 5pm. She suggested that it was a structural change that needed to take place, and that employers needed to have the confidence to implement flexible hiring. Finally she called on The Council to champion flexible hiring in the region.

A member asked if Timewise were struggling with championing flexible hiring arrangements due to the negative aspects of zero hours contracts for many employees. In response Emma Stewart said that Timewise tried to target jobs paying salaries of £20,000 FTE and above, but that they had encountered issues with employers and zero hours contracts.

A member commented that flexible working can cause problems for those on universal credit, as the universal credit system often failed to fill the gaps when work is not available for individuals. In response Emma Stewart said she agreed, and that the Government needed to change its approach with Job Centres, as their main type of advice was to get more hours as opposed to looking for better quality employment.

A member commented that it was apparent how multi-layered this issue was, resulting from the interplay of structural, cultural, sociological and psychological barriers. Following this she said that it was apparent from the report that whilst women can do well in the city, those who were part of another inequality strand due to age, class, ethnicity or disability were clearly at a major disadvantage. Finally she suggested the agenda continued to be developed as a key theme on a longer term basis.

A member commented that being a Black Minority Ethnic (BME) woman in the city seemed to present a glass ceiling, and asked for Atiha Chaudry from the GM BME Network's view on the issue. In response Atiha Chaudry echoed this comment, and said that the Council needed to reflect upon BME women's access to the labour market at every stage of recruitment, as well as think of ways to guide women down high quality career paths. Following this she recommended the council formed a women's committee to focus on these issues, and that a women's strategy should be developed with a focus on BME women. She made the point that different women from different communities had different needs at different stages of life. Finally she said she would welcome a BME Women task and finish group if it were to be formed.

A member commented that many maternity rights for women were enshrined in EU law, and that Brexit was a threat to maintaining these. A member commented that on a community and voluntary basis women excel in ways directly transferable to business, and that there needed to be ways found to tap into those resources looking forward.

Beth Powell, Future Skills Project Manager Oxfam outlined her work with the Oxfam Shop Network. She informed the Committee that the project got women into work at Oxfam shops and that the charity paid out of pocket expenses and childcare costs. She said this benefited participants by helping them gain new skills, gain confidence and obtain job references. She commented that when talking to those participating on the project common themes emerged as barriers to the job market. These included employability services running sessions at difficult times, providing poor childcare services, not helping boost their confidence, not meeting their learning needs, not prioritising them as individuals and not providing routes to employment.

A member gave their praise for the work of Oxfam, and commented that it was disappointing that training was at difficult hours for women.

The Lead Member for Age-Friendly Manchester said that through her experience it appeared that many women had two different working lives, and that once women have fallen off the career path they found it incredibly hard to get back on it. Following this she said that there should have been more work done regarding training and opportunities for older women, and that the council should play a part in this. She commented that many of these women had the skills and experience for work but not the qualifications, and that more should have been done to help encourage them to engage with the workplace.

Dr Sheena Johnson, Occupational Psychologist at Manchester Business School presented to the Committee, focusing on age discrimination in the workplace. She outlined that at present the evidence showed a continued trend of age discrimination in the labour market, effecting recruitment, employment, and health and wellbeing. She informed the Committee that this effect was at times compounded by gender, and then even more so by race or ethnic identity making the labour market highly inaccessible. She also commented that women were considered old at a younger age than men. She recommended that the Council offer advice and support to employers regarding this issue, particularly to SME's and the private sector, this she recommended should include general advice, as well as awareness training for managing older employees.

Emma Stewart commented that Timewise was running a programme with HR professionals who are acting as bridges and brokers to older women trying to get into work.

Atiha Chaudry commented that the issue of getting women aged 50+ into the workplace was of massive importance, and that thought needs to be put into how work on this issue is brought into the public domain.

Jill Rubery, Professor of Comparative Employment Systems at Manchester Business School presented to the Committee, focusing on the structural constraints put in place against women's participation in the labour market. She first made the point that Universal credit was set up in a way that it discriminated against second earners in a household, and though this was a national issue it should be focused upon. She also highlighted how many low paying jobs women worked were actually undervalued jobs, and that wages needed to increase in areas such as social care. Finally she highlighted the inflexibility of many types of work as a constraint, and that flexible working conditions were mainly in the public sector.

A member commented that there were further challenges in this area such as domestic violence, and that a focus needed to be put on this as a specific barrier going forward. The member also highlighted LGBT issues as a barrier, with many workplace discrimination issues still a day to day reality for LGBT people. The member also commented that whilst it was important to discuss aspirations their focus should not drop from workers in retail and hospitality, and that there needed to

be a focus on getting these jobs properly recognised through good working conditions and wages.

Victoria Bettany, Senior Researcher at the Centre for Local Economic Strategies commented that it was inspiring to see so many people around the room discussing these issues, and that it was important to think about who the decision makers will be regarding these issues, and their priorities.

Lou Cordwell commented that the most flexible way for women to work was to run their own businesses, allowing them to manage their work life balance themselves.

The Deputy Leader commented that the Council had a responsibility as an anchor institution to tackle a great number of the issues discussed. He said that a revision of the work and skills strategy was taking place and he would be interested to see the Committee's feedback.

The Chair thanked guests for attending the committee.. The Chair recommended that the underutilised and under supported potential of women in the economy be properly addressed through the Our Manchester approach and the Work and Skills Strategy. The Chair recommended the possibility of Manchester becoming a Timewise Council be explored. The Chair recommended the Resources and Governance Scrutiny Committee look in further detail at how the Council can play a role as an example and anchor institution in the city to forward this agenda. The Chair recommend that consideration be given to how best the council can help facilitate role models to work with women. The Chair recommended that consideration be given to how best the council can help older women get into, or back into work. The Chair recommended that a stronger focus be given to BME women in future reports on this issue. The Committee ask the item return following the renewal of the Work and Skills strategy.

## **Decisions**

1. To recommend that the underutilised and under supported potential of women in the economy be properly addressed through the Our Manchester approach and the Work and Skills Strategy.
2. To recommend that the possibility of Manchester becoming a Timewise Council be explored.
3. To recommend the Resources and Governance Scrutiny Committee look in further detail at how the Council can play a role as an example and anchor institution in the city to forward this agenda.
4. To recommend that consideration be given to how best the council can help facilitate role models to work with women.
5. The Committee ask the item return following the renewal of the Work and Skills strategy.

6. To recommend that consideration be given to how best the council can help older women get into, or back into work.
7. To recommend that a stronger focus be given to BME women in future reports on this issue.

### **ESC/17/20 Quarterly Economy Dashboard Q3 2016/17**

The Committee received the Quarterly Economy Dashboard, a report of the Core Performance and Intelligence Team. The Performance Analyst and Governance Lead presented the report to the Committee. A member asked why Manchester was doing poorly on equality, health and wellbeing. In response the Performance Analyst and Governance Lead said that it was difficult to give an overview of this based on such a wide range of key performance indicators, but that Manchester's performance generally reflects its unique geography as a authority, which also makes it difficult to make constructive comparisons with other cities.

A member asked how Grant Thornton obtained the information used in the report. In response the Performance Analyst and Governance Lead said that Grant Thornton worked with a wide number of organisations to obtain the data set used in the report. A member asked if the decline in the quarterly number of vacancies was a sign that the economy was slowing down. In response the Performance Analyst and Governance Lead said that at this time he did not want to draw conclusions, and that it would be more prudent to wait a few more quarters.

A member asked for clarification regarding what the decrease of outruns to global financial centres referred to. In response the Performance Analyst and Governance Lead said that the trend generally showed increased lines of travel between global financial centres and Manchester, and that this illustrates Manchester's role in growing these centres.

The Chair commented that it would be helpful to consider adding a more in depth section with the Performance Analyst and Governance Lead regarding the economic dashboard at the beginning of the following municipal year.

#### **Decision:**

To note the report.

### **ESC/17/21 Overview Report**

A report of the Governance and Scrutiny Support Unit was submitted. The overview report contained key decisions within the Committee's remit, responses to previous recommendations and the Committee's work programme. The Committee was asked to approve the work programme.

#### **Decision:**



To note the report and approve the work programme.